Understanding stranded assets

Stranded assets are fossil fuel deposits, including oil, gas and coal, that should remain unburned or in the ground in order for the world to avoid the worst impacts of climate change. These unsustainable assets are exposed to risks of write-offs or downward revaluations from both general market movements and increasing regulations driven by the realisation that current economic activities have to change if we are to avoid a rise in global average temperature of more than 2°C above pre-industrial levels. In order to stay within the limits of the 2°C increase, the majority of remaining deposits must remain “stranded.”

There is an increasing body of academic, economic and financial research into the subject. This stranded assets research covers a variety of topics including identifying the level of potential stranded assets; the cost of extracting those reserves; modelled levels of stock revaluations if assets become stranded; the impact on the stock exchanges on which the stranded assets are quoted; accounting standards; corporate creditworthiness and ratings. The vital importance of energy in driving GDP growth means that the impacts of climate change and the notion of stranded assets could lead to systemic economic, financial and risk issues for governments, regulators and financial markets.
Chart 1 below shows that between approximately 9 – 12% of the total size of developed world stock markets come from companies’ revenues/reserves directly linked to carbon over the last 8 years.

**Chart 1**

![Chart showing index weight percentage over time](image)

Source: FTSE Group, March 31, 2014

**What are the reactions to this possible systemic risk?**

There are four broad responses market participants may adopt to the challenges posed by stranded assets:

i. ignore the risks and do nothing;

ii. accept that it is necessary to factor in the long-term shift to a Low-Carbon Economy into valuations and capital allocation; understand the exposure to a range of future scenarios; ensure that these risks are considered in the risk management and asset allocation processes; engage with companies to ensure that management are scrutinised and challenged effectively on their use of capital; engage with policymakers and financial regulators about long-term systemic risks posed by climate disruption;

iii. systematically adjust the portfolio to be tilted towards those companies with a relatively low carbon footprint whilst simultaneously be tilted away from those with a relatively high carbon footprint; or

iv. divest either directly by selling fossil fuel companies or, more indirectly, by structuring new portfolios without exposure to fossil fuels. In recent years, a number of fossil fuel divestment initiatives have been gathering pace – for example 350.org ([http://350.org/](http://350.org/)); and Divest-Invest Philanthropy ([http://divestinvest.org/](http://divestinvest.org/)).
Methodologies to capture stranded assets in an equity index

There are a number of ways of capturing a carbon management strategy in an equity index, including:

- totally exclude stocks with stranded assets
- select a threshold of carbon exposure above which companies would be excluded
- create a tilted index where the weights of the constituents are tilted towards/away from those constituents with relatively lower/higher levels of stranded assets. Although the average exposure to stranded assets is reduced, it is not completely eliminated
- combine a carbon tilted index with an Environmental, Social and Governance and climate change/environment erosion/resource depletion overlay – any desired (practical) level of expected tracking error can be targeted
- indexes may be traditional market capitalisation weighted or alternatively weighted, for example, fundamentally weighted or risk management weighted.

Exclusion criteria

Industry exposure to un-burnable carbon and stranded assets may come in a variety of forms:

i. upstream companies that explore, own and exploit carbon reserves – literally, the companies that explore, find, extract and determine whether or not to leave the carbon (in its various forms) in the ground;

ii. the midstream and support companies that are involved in the supply chains of the upstream companies included in category i. above;

iii. the companies whose goods, products or services use the extracted carbon in a multitude of processes that emit pollutants into the atmosphere – typically CO₂ and methane, but also black soot and other particulates; and

iv. lending institutions that provide the finance to explore, develop and utilise the carbon deposits.

The objective of the FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuel index is to eliminate the companies that explore, own, and directly extract carbon reserves, as outlined in section i. above.
Chart 2 shows the historic performance of the Industry Classification Benchmark (ICB) subsectors that have the most direct exposure to stranded carbon assets.

**Chart 2**

Source: FTSE Group, March 31, 2014. Past performance is no guarantee of future results.

FTSE exclusion criteria are designed to be transparent, easy to understand, quantifiable and repeatable.

Excluded stocks are companies whose principal business activity is identified by a combination of

- Industry Classification Benchmark\(^1\) (ICB) Subsector; and
- Standard Industrial Classification\(^2\) (SIC) System.

Companies that satisfy the following conditions are excluded from the index:

- classified as in the ICB subsectors – Exploration & Production (0533), Integrated Oil & Gas (0537), Coal Mining (1771) and General Mining (1775); and either
  - have revenues arising from Bituminous Coal and Lignite Surface Mining (SIC code: 1221), Bituminous Coal Underground Mining (SIC code: 1222), Anthracite Mining (SIC code: 1231), Crude Petroleum and Natural Gas (SIC code: 1311) or Natural Gas Liquids (SIC code: 1321); or
  - proved and probable reserves in coal, oil or gas based on the companies' published Annual Report and Accounts.

Companies that provide services to the fossil fuel industry, use fossil fuels, or finance exploration are not excluded from the index. The index is tailored to specifically exclude those companies directly engaged in extracting the fossil fuels that are at the heart of stranded assets.

---

1. Industry Classification Benchmark – a Single Standard Defining the Market ([www.icbenchmark.com](http://www.icbenchmark.com))
**Structure of the Excluded Stocks**

Table 1 shows the summary of the excluded stocks’ market capitalisation, weight and total stock count based on the constituents of the FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuels Index at March 31, 2014.

**Table 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ICB subsector</th>
<th>Market value of excluded stocks (US$ bn)</th>
<th>Percent of total</th>
<th>Nr. of excluded companies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Oil &amp; Gas</td>
<td>1,554</td>
<td>59.9</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploration &amp; Production</td>
<td>671</td>
<td>25.9</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Mining</td>
<td>353</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coal Mining</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,594</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>76</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: FTSE Group, March 31, 2014

Chart 3 shows the market capitalisation of the Excluded Stocks split by country and ICB Subsector, in the form of a heatmap –

- Companies within the Integrated Oil & Gas subsector – with an aggregate market value of US$1,554bn – are the largest excluded sector. The stocks in this subsector are concentrated in the US and UK markets (US$758bn and US$447bn of market capitalisation respectively) which represents over 77% of the subsector
- The USA, UK, Canada and Australia are the most affected countries
- The Coal Mining subsector is relatively small and confined to just three countries, of which the USA is the most important; however, a number of diversified mining companies with fossil fuel interests are captured in the General Mining subsector.

**Chart 3**

Source: FTSE Group, March 31, 2014
Chart 4 shows the country exposure of the FTSE Developed Index (top panel) and, for comparison, the FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuels Index (bottom panel). They are broadly similar.

The middle panel (shown in green bars) represents the percentages of the country weights in the FTSE Developed Index that are represented by the excluded assets. For example, this panel shows that the excluded stocks represent approximately 25% of the value of Norway in the FTSE Developed Index. So, whilst the USA market contains the largest absolute value of excluded assets (relative to the size of the market (see Chart 3), concentration of the excluded stocks in the USA market is more modest as can be seen in the middle panel of Chart 4. Relative to the size of the counties in the index, Norway, UK, Portugal, Canada, Italy and Australia are the most affected.

There are additional financial and valuation ratios, risk analytics, attribution analysis, etc., that can reveal additional insight into the differences between the FTSE Developed Index and the FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuel Index. So, for example, the dividend yield on the FTSE Developed Index is approximately 2.40%; this falls by 6bps to 2.34% for the FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuel Index, reflecting the fact that the excluded stocks have a higher dividend yield on average.

Source: FTSE Group, March 31, 2014
**Measuring the market**

The FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuel Index is based on total exclusion – those stocks that are identified as excluded stocks are removed entirely from the index.

Chart 5 shows the historic performance of the FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuel Index against its benchmark (the FTSE Developed Index). It can be seen that historically over the entire period the return of the two indexes are very close to each other, but the FTSE Developed ex Fossil Fuel index has lower volatility.

![Chart 5](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>AWD (%) pa</th>
<th>AWD ex Fossil Fuels (%) pa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Return</td>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>6.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volatility</td>
<td>18.03</td>
<td>18.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excess return</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking error</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: FTSE Group, March 31, 2014. Past performance is no guarantee of future results.

**Acknowledgement**

The ex Fossil Fuel Index has been designed and built with the close co-operation of the Natural Resources Defense Council, a not-for-profit organization with more than 1.4 million members that works to protect the world’s natural resources, public health and the environment (see [www.nrdc.org](http://www.nrdc.org)).
For more information about our indexes, please visit ftserussell.com.

© 2015 London Stock Exchange Group companies.

London Stock Exchange Group companies includes FTSE International Limited (“FTSE”), Frank Russell Company (“Russell”), MTS Next Limited (“MTS”), and FTSE TMX Global Debt Capital Markets Inc (“FTSE TMX”). All rights reserved.

“FTSE®”, “Russell®”, “MTS®”, “FTSE TMX®” and “FTSE Russell” and other service marks and trademarks related to the FTSE or Russell indexes are trademarks of the London Stock Exchange Group companies and are used by FTSE, MTS, FTSE TMX and Russell under licence.

All information is provided for information purposes only. Every effort is made to ensure that all information given in this publication is accurate, but no responsibility or liability can be accepted by the London Stock Exchange Group companies nor its licensors for any errors or for any loss from use of this publication.

Neither the London Stock Exchange Group companies nor any of their licensors make any claim, prediction, warranty or representation whatsoever, expressly or impliedly, either as to the results to be obtained from the use of the FTSE Russell Indexes or the fitness or suitability of the Indexes for any particular purpose to which they might be put.

The London Stock Exchange Group companies do not provide investment advice and nothing in this document should be taken as constituting financial or investment advice. The London Stock Exchange Group companies make no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any asset. A decision to invest in any such asset should not be made in reliance on any information herein. Indexes cannot be invested in directly. Inclusion of an asset in an index is not a recommendation to buy, sell or hold that asset. The general information contained in this publication should not be acted upon without obtaining specific legal, tax, and investment advice from a licensed professional.

No part of this information may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the London Stock Exchange Group companies. Distribution of the London Stock Exchange Group companies’ index values and the use of their indexes to create financial products require a licence with FTSE, FTSE TMX, MTS and/or Russell and/or its licensors.

The Industry Classification Benchmark (“ICB”) is owned by FTSE. FTSE does not accept any liability to any person for any loss or damage arising out of any error or omission in the ICB.

Past performance is no guarantee of future results. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes only. Index returns shown may not represent the results of the actual trading of investable assets. Certain returns shown may reflect back-tested performance. All performance presented prior to the index inception date is back-tested performance. Back-tested performance is not actual performance, but is hypothetical. The back-test calculations are based on the same methodology that was in effect when the index was officially launched. However, back-tested data may reflect the application of the index methodology with the benefit of hindsight, and the historic calculations of an index may change from month to month based on revisions to the underlying economic data used in the calculation of the index.
About FTSE Russell

FTSE Russell is a leading global provider of benchmarking, analytics and data solutions for investors, giving them a precise view of the market relevant to their investment process. A comprehensive range of reliable and accurate indexes provides investors worldwide with the tools they require to measure and benchmark markets across asset classes, styles or strategies.

FTSE Russell index expertise and products are used extensively by institutional and retail investors globally. For over 30 years, leading asset owners, asset managers, ETF providers and investment banks have chosen FTSE Russell indexes to benchmark their investment performance and create ETFs, structured products and index-based derivatives.

FTSE Russell is focused on applying the highest industry standards in index design and governance, employing transparent rules-based methodology informed by independent committees of leading market participants. FTSE Russell fully embraces the IOSCO Principles and its Statement of Compliance has received independent assurance. Index innovation is driven by client needs and customer partnerships, allowing FTSE Russell to continually enhance the breadth, depth and reach of its offering.

FTSE Russell is wholly owned by London Stock Exchange Group.

For more information, visit www.ftserussell.com.